**Date:** 28 July 2022

**From:** Co-Chairs, AFRINIC Policy Development Working Group

**To:** The AFRINIC Board of Directors

**Subject:** Report on the Policy Proposal PDP Working Group (WG) Guidelines and Procedures AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT06

**Introduction**

In line with the Policy Development Process as documented in the Consolidated Policy Manual, we have noted  that the above-mentioned policy proposal attained rough consensus at the last Public Policy Meeting held in hybrid format  01-02 June 2022  during the AFRINIC-35 meeting.

As Co-chairs, we believe that the current version of the proposal (*version no.6*) addresses notes and observations made by interested community members that participated in discussions during the life-cycle of the proposal since the first draft. The last call period was concluded on 14 July 2022.

The table below shows the milestones in the policy proposal progress;

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Date** | **Milestone/Activity** |
| 22 July 2020 | The proposal was received on [rpd@afrinic.net](mailto:rpd@afrinic.net) on 21 July 2020 |
|  | Proposal was given the  ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT01**  and posted on website <https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d1> |
| 24 July 2020 | Announcement done on RPD mailing list <https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2020/010890.html> |
| 30 July 2020 | The proposal was updated on the website with textual updates ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT02** [**https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d2**](https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d2) |
| 09 Sep 2020 | AFRINIC published the Impact Assessment of the proposal on the website <https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d2#impact> |
| 16 Sep 2020 | Proposal with  ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT02**  was presented and discussed at the *AFRINIC-32*  Public Policy Meeting. |
| 16 Sep 2020 | Co-Chairs decision: No Consensus. |
| 22 May 2021 | An update to the proposal was received and posted on the website with ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT03** [**https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d3**](https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d3) |
| 4 Nov 2021 | Impact assessment for ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT03** was published and announced <https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013889.html> |
| 10 Nov 2021 | An update to the proposal was received and posted on the website with ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT04** [**https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d4**](https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2020-gen-002-d4) |
| 17 Nov 2021 | Proposal with  ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT04**  was presented and discussed at the *AFRINIC-34*  Public Policy Meeting. |
| 17 Nov 2021 | Co-Chairs decision: No Consensus |
| 24 May 2022 | An update to the proposal was received and posted on the website with ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT05** |
| 31 May 2022 | Impact assessment of the proposal **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT05** was updated on the website |
| 01 Jun 2022 | Proposal with  ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT05**  was presented and discussed at the *AFRINIC-35*  Public Policy Meeting. |
| 01 Jun 2022 | Co-Chairs decision: Rough consensus has been reached. ***The authors will however correct the typo in Section 3.3.10.1 on suspension of posting privileges so that the statement reads as follows “ The Appeal Committee decision shall be final and binding. The draft policy proposal, therefore, moves to the Last Call. The community can engage more on this during the Last Call period.”*** |
| 21 Jun 2022 | An update to the proposal was received and posted on the website with ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT06.** |
| 23 Jun 2022 | The start of the “last-call” period for the proposal with  ID **AFPUB-2020-GEN-002-DRAFT06** was announced by co-chairs. <https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014352.html> |
| 14 Jul 2022 | End of Last Call Announcement. <https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014370.html> |
| 28 Jul 2022 | PDWG Chairs took note of the discussions on the proposal during Last Call and maintain consensus |

The AFRINIC PDWG Chairs have gone through the discussions on the RPD mailing list during the Last Call and prepared this report. As supporting documentation, the summary of the assessment conducted is as follows:-.

**Summary of the assessment**

The assessment of the discussions before the AFRINIC-35 PPM are compiled in the table below:-

|  |
| --- |
| **Objections/Concerns on Draft-04** |
| The PDP is not just "guidelines" it is strict rules, it can't be subjected to interpretations and then we come into trouble. CPM has rules. |
| rejecting inputs is discriminatory. If someone was too busy to participate in part of the discussion he/she has the right to come in at any time during the discussion. May have inputs that have not been considered before and in any case, he has the right to express an opinion. That section must be completely deleted. |
| Is bad to have a mention to specific sections of the bylaws, they can change (they should, in fact, they must not encroach the community and PDP) |
| Lack of consensus definition. Many folks don't read RFCs - there is no clear view of if the consensus is determined also in the mailing list discussion. Lack of last-call definition Lack of clear timings for all the processes. |

**During Last Call Period**

During the Last Call period, there was only one(1) new contribution to the proposal, which is summarised below :-

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Objections** | **Addressed?** |
| *I disagree with the process of appointing co-chairs. This is not a practical process and rough consensus cannot be used to appoint co-chairs as defined by the new PPV  (AFPUB-2021-GEN-002-DRAFT03). This PPV (definition of consensus or rough consensus )would have a direct effect on  AFPUB-2002-GEN-DRAFT06.* | **Addressed**  The definition of consensus or rough consensus in Section 3.1.1 in the proposal Update of PDP(AFPUB-2021-GEN-002-DRAFT03)  is broad enough and covers the appointment of PDWG Chairs by consensus in Section 3.3.3 |

**Conclusion and Recommendation**

Based on the above information, we advise the AFRINIC Board to consider the ratification report since on the basis of the current wording of the Consolidated Policy Manual, this proposal has reached consensus as the objection raised during Last Call is not valid.

***Additional Notes***

An  implementation conflict has been highlighted by the Policy Liaison Team and this  confirms that more than one draft policy proposal amending a particular section of the CPM will lead to conflicting text in the CPM and therefore implementation issues, should they both reach consensus at the same Public Policy Meeting. The PDWG has been consistently appraised of the situation since May 2021. However, no collaborative effort was noted among the authors to ensure that their proposals do not overlap or from the PDWG to ensure that the CPM is updated to provide the PDWG Chairs guidance as to how to address multiple proposals that overlap.

In light of this unprecedented situation, the PDWG Chairs have also informed the Policy Liaison Team that the scope of the  impact assessment shall also be broadened and include the impact of all policies under discussion on the Consolidated Policy Manual in the event that they have all reached consensus at the same time.

Vincent Ngundi & Darwin Da Costa

**AFRINIC PDWG CO-CHAIRS**