

Date: 14 Jan 2022

From: Co-Chairs, AFRINIC Policy Development Working Group

To: The AFRINIC Board of Directors

Subject: Report on the Policy Proposal ” **Abuse Contact Policy Update**  
**AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT07**”

---

## Introduction

In line with the Policy Development Process as documented in the Consolidate Policy Manual, we take note that the above-mentioned policy proposal attained rough consensus at the Public Policy Meeting held in online format, 02-03 June 2021, during the AFRINIC-33 meeting.

As Co-chairs, we believe that the current version of the proposal (*version 7*) addresses concerns and observations made by interested community members that participated in discussions during the life-cycle of the proposal since the first draft. The last call period was concluded at 23h59 UTC on 9 January 2022.

The table below shows the milestones in the policy proposal progress;

12 Aug 2018	New proposal received & given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT01</b>
20 Nov 2018	An updated version of the proposal was received and given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT02</b>
29 Nov 2018	Proposal with ID < <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT02</b> > was presented and discussed at the <i>AFRINIC-29</i> Public Policy Meeting. Consensus was not reached and the proposal was sent back to the list for further discussion and refinement.
10 Jun 2019	PDWG Chairs announced an updated version of the proposal has been received and given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT03</b> <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2019/009377.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2019/009377.html</a>

19 Jun 2019	Proposal with ID < <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT03</b> > was presented and discussed at the <i>AFRINIC-30</i> Public Policy Meeting. Consensus was not reached and the proposal was sent back to the list for further discussion and refinement.
4 Nov 2019	An updated version of the proposal was received and given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT04</b>
22 Nov 2019	An updated version of the proposal was received and given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT05</b>
4 Dec 2019	Proposal with ID < <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT05</b> > was presented and discussed at the <i>AFRINIC-31</i> Public Policy Meeting. Consensus was not reached and the proposal was sent back to the list for further discussion and refinement.
10 Aug 2020	PDWG Chairs announced an updated version of the proposal has been received and given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT06</b> <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2020/010942.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2020/010942.html</a>
17 Sep 2020	Proposal with ID < <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT06</b> > was presented and discussed at the <i>AFRINIC-32</i> Public Policy Meeting. Consensus was not reached and the proposal was sent back to the list for further discussion and refinement.
17 May 2021	An updated version of the proposal was received at <a href="mailto:pdwg@afrinic.net">pdwg@afrinic.net</a>
19 May 2021	The proposal was given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT07</b> and published on the website <a href="https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2018-gen-001-d7">https://afrinic.net/policy/proposals/2018-gen-001-d7</a>
20 May 2021	PDWG Chairs announced an updated version of the proposal has been received and given ID <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT07</b> <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013186.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013186.html</a>
2 June 2021	Proposal with ID < <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT07</b> >

	was presented and discussed at the <i>AFRINIC-33</i> Public Policy Meeting.
2 June 2021	PDWG Chairs announced that rough consensus had been reached for the proposal <b>AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT07</b> .
4 June 2021	The start of the “last-call” period was announced by the Co-chairs. <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013213.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013213.html</a>
16 Jun 2021	An appeal against the determination of consensus was lodged. <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013337.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013337.html</a>
24 Jun 2021	PDWG Chairs informed the PDWG about the suspension of all deliberations on this draft policy proposal pending the outcome of the appeal. <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013350.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/013350.html</a>
30 Dec 2021	Chair of Appeal Committee informed the PDWG that the Appeal Committee has finalised the assessment of the appeals and that the reports are published on the AFRINIC website. <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/014064.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2021/014064.html</a>
5 Jan 2022	PDWG Chairs took cognisance that the appeal against the declaration of consensus of this proposal has been set aside <a href="https://www.afrinic.net/ast/pdf/policy/appeal-2021/4.report-appeal-against-confirmation-of-consensus-afpub-2018-gen-001-d7-20211129.pdf">https://www.afrinic.net/ast/pdf/policy/appeal-2021/4.report-appeal-against-confirmation-of-consensus-afpub-2018-gen-001-d7-20211129.pdf</a>
6 Jan 2022	PDWG Chairs announced that Last Call has been extended & shall end on 09 January 2022 at 23:59 UTC <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014098.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014098.html</a>
10 Jan 2022	PDWG Chairs announced the end of Last Call <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014125.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014125.html</a>
14 Jan 2022	AFRINIC PDWG Co-chairs announced that the proposal <b>Abuse Contact Policy Update AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT07</b>

	has reached consensus. <a href="https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014137.html">https://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd/2022/014137.html</a>
--	---

### Additional Notes

The AFRINIC PDWG Co-chairs have gone through the discussions on the RPD mailing list during the Last Call and prepared this report. As supporting documentation, the summary of the assessment conducted is as follows:-.

### Summary of the assessment

Concerns	Addressed/Pending	Notes
I am in opposition with this policy because it is unnecessary as there is already an existing abuse contact policy that is already sufficient and functional as well.	Addressed	Old objection
Indeed it is essential to have a mandatory abuse contact policy but having to put a 6months verification is very unrequited because it is up to the members to decide if they want to reply or not. Hence, members should have the option “not to reply”	Addressed	Old objection
it is not in Afrinic’s mandate to decide or dictate how network holders manage their abuse mailbox. they have the right to determine the type of subjects they can reply and choose the adequate actions to be taken as earlier aforementioned.	Addressed	Old objection
It also contradicts with internet values, making AFRINIC play the role of the central government.	Addressed	Old objection
Afrinic shouldn’t be the one deciding how network holders manage their abuse mailbox. Each one has the right to determine what to reply to and what to ignore and based on that, the whole purpose of this policy is pointless especially if AFRINIC cannot determine what is considered an abuse and what is not	Addressed	Old objection
How can AFRINIC force any member to reply to the « abuse » if AFRINIC cannot determine what is considered an abuse and what is not? Especially that the definition of a criminal/legal activity differs from one jurisdiction to another... It is up to the member to define what they think is acceptable in their network	Addressed	Old objection

operation and how they choose to react to it, so I'm not sure I get what value this policy adds exactly.		
<p>It is very normal and logical for a network to have the abuse contact in their WHOIS registration as part of the AFRINIC's registration service, but as in ICP-2, it is out of the scope of an RIR to intervene in the network's operations, which is exactly what this proposal will result in.</p> <p>Abuse handling is part of a network's operations, thus AFRINIC does not have the mandate to dictate to its members how to handle abuse and what to act on.</p>	Addressed	Old objection

### **Conclusion and Recommendation**

Based on the above information, we advise the AFRINIC Board to ratify the draft policy proposal

**Abuse Contact Policy Update AFPUB-2018-GEN-001-DRAFT07** at its earliest convenience.

Vincent Ngundi & Darwin Da Costa

**AFRINIC PDWG CO-CHAIRS**