

Policy Development in the AFRINIC Region

Sami Salih and Dewole Ajao
PDWG Co-Chairs

Tuesday - 29 November 2016



11:00 – 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 - 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 – 17:00

17:00 – 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Summary of Interesting Proposals at other RIRs

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

- Overview of Policy Development Process
- Proposals under discussion in AFRINIC
- Overview of the Consolidated Policy Manual (CPM)
- Policy Implementation Report



Overview of Policy Development Process

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00





Proposals under discussion

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 – 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

15:30 - 16:00

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

#	Proposal	Date
1	Soft Landing Overhaul	Friday, 12 February 2016
2	Inbound Transfer Policy	Friday, 17 June 2016
3	IPv4 Resource transfer within the AFRINIC Region	Saturday, 23 July 2016
4	IPv4 Soft Landing-BIS	Monday, 25 July 2016
5	Internet Number Resources review by AFRINIC	Tuesday, 9 August 2016



Consolidated Policy Manual (CPM)

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

- The CPM (Consolidated Policy Manual), adopted since Oct 2016, is a single reference document containing policies for managing and distribution of IP number resources in the AFRINIC service region.
- All ratified and implemented policies that have gone through the PDP will be integrated into the CPM.
- All previous individual policy documents are now archived.



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



Proposal update from other Regions

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 – 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

UPDATES FROM:

ARIN (Sean Hopkins)

APNIC (Guangliang Pan)

RIPE (Andrea Cima)

LACNIC (Sergio Rojas)



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Ref. Name: AFPUB-2016-GEN-002-DRAFT-01

Submitted: 17 June 2016

Status: Under Discussion

Author(s): Andrew Alston, Christopher Mwangi



Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 - 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

RPD Summary

Arguments against:

- Inbound policy is unfair to the originating region.
- Encouraging more incoming IPv4 will delay IPv6 implementation in AFRINIC region.

Arguments in favour:

- Useful for organizations that are acquiring or consolidating into an African holding company.
- Advantage to the region since we are the recipient.
- Is a first step towards having a bi-directional policy at a later date.
- Useful since there is at least one RIR compatible with such a policy.
- Inbound policy is fair since AFRINIC has smaller quantity of IP resources than other regions
- Outbound transfer policy can be proposed at a later date



Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

- Any issues not already addressed
- Feedback from the Authors
- Consensus Check
- PDWG Co-chairs Decision



Lunch Break

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 – 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00





11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Ref. Name: **AFPUB-2016-V4-002-DRAFT01**

Submitted: 12 February 2016

Status: Under Discussion

Amends: AFPUB-2010-v4-005 (IPv4 soft landing policy)

Author(s): Andrew Alston, Kris Seeburn, Mark Elkins,

Michele McCann, John Walubengo



Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

RPD Summary

Arguments Against

- Is not fair to organization/regions that are not able to justify IPv4 need at this time
- Makes no provision for critical infrastructure

Arguments In Favor:

- Protects large organizations with present need from undue restrictions
- Lets IPv4 pool run out on needs basis
- Still provides for new entrant block that takes care of up to 512 future members



Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

- Any issues not already addressed
- Feedback from the Authors
- Consensus Check
- PDWG Co-chairs Decision



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 – 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Ref. Name: **AFPUB-2016-V4-001-DRAFT03**

Submitted: 22 July 2016

Author: Omo Oaiya, Joe Kimaili, Alain P. Aina



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

RPD Summary

Arguments Against:

- Reservation block for critical infrastructure overlaps with the already ratified policy for Internet Exchange Points.
- Any reserved block for new entrants should be smaller than the proposed size.
- Strategic reserve for unforeseen circumstance encourages continued dependence on IPv4.
- Mandatory IPv6 allocation is uncalled for as it does not guarantee deployment of IPv6.
- Leads to increased cost of IP addresses for ISPs with large customers whose IPv4 needs exceed the soft-landing provisions



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 - 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

RPD Summary (continued)

Arguments In Favor:

- Critical Infrastructure should be protected with reserved space
- Reservation block for new entrants is a provision for fairness
- Fair distribution is what allowed AFRINIC to get the final /8 IP space being discussed as it could have gone to other RIRs with greater need at the time
- Reduces the strategic reserve of the current soft-landing policy; Strategic reserve is not locked down but Board is allowed to allocate (in the community's best interests) if addresses run out.
- Large customers of ISPs with large IPv4 need can apply to AFRINIC directly for end-user assignment



- 11:00 11:10
- 11:10 11:20
- 11:20 11:30
- 11:30 12:30
- 12:30 13:30
- 13:30 14:30
- 14:30 15:30
- <u>15:30 16:00</u>
- 16:00 17:00
- 17:00 18:00
- 18:00 19:00

- Any issues not already addressed
- Feedback from the Authors
- Consensus Check
- PDWG Co-chairs Decision



Break

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00





11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 – 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Ref. Name: AFPUB-2016-GEN-001-DRAFT03

Submitted: 09 August 2016

Author: Amelina Arnaud, Ilunga Kabwika Serge,

Jean-Baptiste Millogo, Wafa Dahmani



Proposal:

Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 – 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

RPD Summary

Arguments Against

- RSA has provisions for audits and breach thereof.
- AFRINIC already conducts audits when organizations request additional address space.
- Executing large number of audits would put significant workload on AFRINIC financial/human resources.
- Proposal is prone to abuse by competing companies.
- Reclaiming resources will put legal and financial strain on AFRINIC (debunked though)

Arguments in Favour

- Prevents abuse and misuse of resources



Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

- Any issues not already addressed
- Feedback from the Authors
- Consensus Check
- PDWG Co-chairs Decision



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 – 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



Proposal:

IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Ref. Name: **AFPUB-2016-V4-003-DRAFT02**

Submitted: 23 July 2016

Author: Ali HADJI, Komi ELITCHA, Damnam Kanlanfei,

Serge Patrick GHANSAH, Nicholas Mbonimpa,

Alain P. AINA



Proposal:

IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 – 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

RPD Summary

Mostly support for the proposal - Improvements suggested by the community and integrated into by authors.



Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

- Any issues not already addressed
- Feedback from the Authors
- Consensus Check
- PDWG Co-chairs Decision



11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

12:30 - 13:30

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

<u>15:30 – 16:00</u>

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

18:00 - 19:00

Welcome, Introduction & Agenda Overview

Quick Look at the AFRINIC Region PDP

Proposal update from other Regions

Proposal: Inbound Transfer Policy

LUNCH

Proposal: Soft Landing Overhaul

Proposal: IPv4 Soft Landing - BIS

BREAK

Proposal: Internet Number Resources Review by AFRINIC

Proposal: IPv4 Resource Transfer within the AFRINIC region



Open Microphone

11:00 - 11:10

11:10 - 11:20

11:20 - 11:30

11:30 - 12:30

<u>12:30 – 13:30</u>

13:30 - 14:30

14:30 - 15:30

15:30 - 16:00

16:00 - 17:00

17:00 - 18:00

- PDP Review and Brainstorming
- WHOIS Accuracy and Public Safety
- AoB





Policy Development in the AFRINIC Region

Sami Salih and Dewole Ajao
PDWG Co-Chairs