STAFF ASSESSMENT

Policy ID: AFPUB-2015-GEN-001-DRAFT-01

Policy Name: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Assessed: 17.11.2015

---

1.   Staff Interpretation & Understanding

In its current form, the proposal is not clear for staff to understand, interpret and implement as written.

2.   Comments

a.   Staff Comments

The following omissions need to be added to the proposal:

- The title of the proposal is vague about whether this is an intra-RIR or inter-RIR transfer policy.
- Section 2, which is meant to be a summary of how the proposal addresses the problem in Sec 1, introduces a separate topic about transfers of legacy resources. This is a very critical issue that should be introduced separately in Section 3 and be removed from the summary section.
- Definition or classification of the various types of transfers and a detailed process on how AFRINIC will conduct each of those transfers is missing in Sec 3.
- Sec 3b mentions "exhaustion" of IPv4 space – this is ambiguous – and should be clear on whether this refers to the start of issuance from the last /8, or the invocation of the soft-landing policy.
- Sec 3.1b refers to "same business entity". This needs to be properly defined in order not to confuse AFRINIC staff with interpretation.
- Sec 3 needs to be a complete description of the proposal. A reader who ignores the title, section 1, and section 2, but reads section 3, needs to be able to understand the entire proposal.

b.   Legal Adviser's Assessment & Comments

None.

3.   Resource Impact

N/A

4.   Summary & Recommendations

This proposal is confusing for staff to properly interpret and implement as written, until the authors can act upon the staff comments above.

STAFF ASSESSMENT

Policy ID: AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-04

Policy Name: [Out of Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources](#)

Assessed: 17.11.2015

---

1. Staff Interpretation & Understanding

The policy attempts to define what percentage of the number resources allocated to an AFRINIC member can be used outside of the AFRINIC service region.

2. Comments

a. Staff Comments

Staff has observed the following issues:

- Sec 3b – the reference of "time z" appears not necessary. Also edit "if x be the allocation size" to "if x be the total space allocated to the member".
- Sec 3c – the proposal needs to be as clear as possible on what methods AFRINIC staff shall use to measure resources used out-of-region from any given allocation, instead of leaving this to the discretion of AFRINIC staff. For example, if there is a VPN or tunnel in which the server is in the AFRINIC service region but the client is outside the region, then does this count as in-region or out-of-region use?

b. Legal Adviser's Assessment & Comments

Replace content of Clause 3f with: "*To all intents and purposes, this proposed policy shall be read and applied in addition to any such existing AFRINIC policy(ies) governing the same subject matter*".

3. Resource Impact

N/A

4. Summary & Recommendations

As written, the proposal will present issues to implement, especially Clause 3c, which gives AFRINIC staff discretion on determining how to compute resources used out-of-region. The method of computation needs to be explicitly defined in this policy proposal.